

# STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350
www.nj.qov/bpu/

**ENERGY & CLEAN ENERGY** 

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF PUBLIC	)	ORDER ON MOTION
SERVICE ELECTRIC AND GAS COMPANY FOR	)	TO INTERVENE
APPROVAL OF ITS CLEAN ENERGY FUTURE –	)	
ELECTRIC VEHICLE AND ENERGY STORAGE ("CEF-	)	
EVES") PROGRAM ON A REGUALTED BASIS	)	DOCKET NO. EO18101111

#### Parties of Record:

Stefanie Brand, Esq., Director, NJ Division of Rate Counsel
Matthew M. Weissman, Esq., General Regulatory Counsel, PSEG Services Company
Matthew S. Slowinski, Esq., Counsel for CCMT and MSEIA
Murray E. Bevan, Esq., Counsel for ChargePoint, Inc.
Christopher E. Torkelson, Esq., Counsel for Direct Energy Business, LLC, et al.
Steven G. Goldenberg, Esq., Counsel for NJLEUC
William Harla, Esq., Counsel for Enel X North America. Inc.
Daniel Greenhouse, Esq., Counsel for ENF, EDF, and NRDC
James H. Laskey, Esq., Counsel for Burns & McDonnell Engineering Company, LLC
Lauri A. Mazzuchetti, Esq., Counsel for Sunrun, Inc.
Martin C. Rothfelder, Esq., Counsel for EVgo Services, LLC
Nathan Howe, Esq., Counsel for Greenlots
Kevin Auerbacher, Esq., Counsel for Tesla
Paul Yousif, Esq., Counsel for Blue Bird Body Company
Ira G. Megdal, Esq., Counsel for Electrify America, LLC

# BY COMMISSIONER UPENDRA J. CHIVUKULA:

On October 11, 2018, Public Service Electric and Gas Company ("PSE&G" or "Company") filed a petition ("Petition") with the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") requesting approval of its Clean Energy Future – Electric Vehicle and Energy Storage Program ("CEF-EVES Program" or "Program"). The proposed Program would consist of up to \$261 million of investment over a period of six (6) years and approximately \$103 million in expenses. PSE&G claims that the proposed Program will support the widespread adoption of electric vehicles ("EV"), including multifamily and low income customers. Additionally, the Petition maintains that the EV program will have extensive societal benefits including environmental benefits, job creation, supporting schools, mitigation of EV market barriers, and increased knowledge of how to optimize the distribution system through smart chargers with two-way communication.

By Order dated October 29, 2018 ("October 2018 Order"), the Board determined that the Petition described above should be retained by the Board for hearing and, pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:2-32, designated myself as the presiding officer authorized to rule on all motions that arise during the pendency of these proceedings and modify any schedules that may be set as necessary to secure a just and expeditious determination of the issues. Further, the October 2018 Order directed that any entities seeking to intervene or participate in this matter file the appropriate application with the Board by November 13, 2018.

On December 7, 2018, the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") filed a Motion to Stay ("Stay Motion"), requesting the Board to stay the Petition until the conclusion of several administrative proceedings.

On April 22, 2020, a Prehearing Order was issued ("April 2020 Prehearing Order") wherein a procedural schedule was set and motions for intervention and participation status were ruled upon. The following motions to intervene were granted: The New Jersey Large Energy Users Coalition ("NJLEUC"), Enel X North America, Inc. ("Enel X"), Blue Bird Body Corporation ("Blue Bird"), Burns & McDonnell Engineering Company, Inc. ("BMcD"), Charge Point, Inc. ("Charge Point"), Climate Change Mitigation Technologies, LLC ("CCMT"), EVgo Services, LLC ("EVgo"), Zeco Systems, Inc. d/b/a Greenlots ("Greenlots"), Environmental Defense Fund, Natural Resources Defense Council, Environment New Jersey, and Sierra Club (hereinafter "Environmentalists"), Mid-Atlantic Solar & Storage Industries Association ("MSSIA"), Tesla Inc. ("Tesla"), Direct Energy Business, LLC ("Direct Energy"), and Sunrun, Inc. ("Sunrun"). The following motions to participate were granted: Atlantic City Electric Company ("ACE"), Alliance for Transportation Electrification ("Alliance"), Jersey Central Power & Light Company ("JCP&L"), Rockland Electric Company ("RECO"), and SemaConnect, LLC ("SemaConect"). The April 2020 Prehearing Order also denied the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel's ("Rate Counsel") Motion to Stay filed in December 2018.

Within procedural schedule set forth in the April 2020 Prehearing Order, all motions were due April 17, 2020. Discovery and responses have been propounded throughout July and August, 2020. As established in the April 2020 Prehearing Order, intervener testimony was due September 4, 2020 and evidentiary hearings are set for the week of December 7, 2020.

By order on Motion for Reconsideration dated May 14, 2020, Power Edison, LLC was granted intervener status.

On or about April 17, 2020, Rate Counsel filed a motion to dismiss a portion of the Petition. PSE&G then filed an opposition to Rate Counsel's motion on May 8, 2020 which was joined by intervenors, Blue Bird, CCMT, Charge Point, the Environmentalists, EVgo, Greenlots, BMcD, and MSSIA. On May 8, 2020, Direct Energy Business, LLC, et al., NRG Energy, Inc., and Just Energy Group Inc. (collectively, "Market Participants") filed a letter in support of Rate Counsel's Motion to Dismiss. Rate Counsel filed a reply to PSE&G's opposition on May 22, 2020.

On July 1 2020, Rate Counsel's motion to dismiss was denied and the parties were ordered to continue to move through the procedural schedule.

## **THE MOTION**

## Motion to Intervene

Electrify America, LLC

Electrify America, LLC ("Electrify America") filed a Motion to Intervene on August 6, 2020. Electrify America is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Volkswagen Group of America headquartered in Reston, Virginia. In its motion, Electrify America asserted it is investing \$2 billion over 10 years on zero-emissions vehicle ("ZEV") infrastructure, education and awareness, and efforts to support the increased adoption of ZEV technology in the United States. As a part the first half of its investment, Electrify America states it is building a nationwide network of ultra-fast direct current fast charging stations across over 500 locations and with over 2,000 individual direct current fast chargers already in operation.

Electrify America contends that its relationships with owners and operators of EVs is unique based upon its business model, and accordingly, its interests are individual and cannot be represented adequately by any other party in this proceeding. Electrify America maintains that its existing and planned charging infrastructure will be materially impacted by the utility's proposed programs, including a potential for an increased cost of doing business due to this proceeding.

According to its Motion to Intervene, Electrify America did not operate any charging stations in New Jersey in November 2018 when intervention motions were originally due. However, presently Electrify America has nine charging stations in New Jersey, eight of which are in PSE&G territory.

Electrify America affirmed it will not add confusion to, or otherwise delay, the proceeding in any way and stated that it would abide by the existing procedural schedule.

#### **RESPONSES**

On August 13, 2020, PSE&G filed opposition to Electrify America's motion to intervene, stating that the motion is untimely and inclusion at this late stage in the proceeding as an intervenor may cause unnecessary confusion and delay. The opposition further states that Electrify America's interests are not sufficiently different from other parties, and as such, is already well represented by existing intervenors. PSE&G does maintain, however, that it does not object to Electrify America's inclusion in the proceeding as a participant.

Electrify America filed a reply to PSE&G's opposition on August 14, 2020, stating that its interests are not served by another intervenor because its business model is substantially different from other intervenors, nor can its interests be materially represented by the other parties. Electrify America reasserts that it will abide by the existing procedural schedule and will not cause delays. Lastly, Electrify America requests that its motion be granted so that it may present evidence which will assist in the Board making a decision on the Petition.

#### **DISCUSSIONS AND FINDINGS**

In ruling on a motion to intervene, N.J.A.C. 1:1-16.3(a) requires that the decision-maker consider the following factors:

- 1. The nature and extent of the moving party's interest in the outcome of the case;
- 2. Whether that interest is sufficiently different from that of any other party so as to add measurably and constructively to the scope of the case;
- 3. The prospect for confusion and delay arising from inclusion of the party; and
- 4. Other appropriate matters.

After consideration of the papers, I <u>HEREBY FIND</u>, pursuant to N.J.A.C. 1:1-16.3, Electrify America will be directly affected by the outcome of this proceeding and its interests are not currently served by another party. I <u>HEREBY FIND</u> that Electrify America will add measurably and constructively, while abiding by the current procedural schedule.

While untimely, I <u>HEREBY FIND</u> that Electrify America's Motion to Intervene has met the standards for intervention in this proceeding. Accordingly, I <u>HEREBY GRANT</u> the motion to intervene by Electrify America pursuant to the authority granted to me by the Board under the October 2018 Order. Due to the tardiness of Electrify America's participation in this proceeding, I <u>HEREBY ORDER</u> that, as an intervener in this proceeding, Electrify America must abide by the existing procedural schedule set forth in the April 2020 Prehearing Order.

DATED: September 17, 2020 BY:

UPENDRA J. CHIVUKULA

COMMISSIONER

# IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF PUBLIC SERVICE ELECTRIC AND GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF ITS CLEANENERGY FUTURE – ELECTRIC VEHICLE AND ENERGY STORAGE ("CEF-EVES") PROGRAM ON A REGUALTED BASIS BPU DOCKET NO. E018101111

#### **SERVICE LIST**

## PSE&G

PSEG Services Corporation 80 Park Plaza, T5G Post Office Box 570 Newark NJ 07102

Joseph F. Accardo, Jr., Esq. joseph.accardojr@pseg.com

Joseph A. Shea, Esq. joseph.shea@pseg.com

Bernard Smalls bernard.smalls@pseg.com

Caitlyn White caitlyn.white@pseg.com

Michele Falcao michele.falcao@pseg.com

Danielle Lopez, Esq. danielle.lopez@pseg.com

Katherine E. Smith, Esq. katherine.smith@pseg.com

# **Board of Public Utilities**

44 South Clinton Avenue, 9th Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Aida Camacho-Welch, Secretary Board.secretary@bpu.nj.gov

Paul E. Flanagan, Esq. Executive Director paul.flanagan@bpu.nj.gov

Robert Brabston, Esq., Deputy Executive Director robert.brabston@bpu.nj.gov

Christine Sadovy, Chief of Staff christine.sadovy@bpu.nj.gov

Division of Clean Energy Kelly Mooij, Director kelly.mooij@bpu.nj.gov

Sherri Jones. Assistant Director sherri.jones@bpu.nj.gov

Cathleen Lewis cathleen.lewis@bpu.nj.gov

Division of Energy

Stacy Peterson, Director stacy.peterson@bpu.nj.gov

Ryan Moran ryan.moran@bpu.nj.gov

John Zarzycki john.zaryzkci@bpu.nj.gov

Counsel's Office

Abe Silverman, Esq., General Counsel abe.silverman@bpu.nj.gov

Andrea Hart, Esq. andrea.hart@bpu.nj.gov

# **Rate Counsel**

140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director sbrand@rpa.nj.gov

Brian 0. Lipman, Esq., Litigation Manager blipman@rpa.nj.gov

Henry Ogden, Esq. hoqden@rpa.nj.gov

# **Division of Law**

25 Market Street Post Office Box 112 Trenton, NJ 08625

Michael Beck, DAG michael.beck@law.njoag.gov

Pamela Owen, DAG pamela.owen@law.njoag.gov

# **Bluebird Body Corporation**

James H. Laskey Norris Mcaughlin, P.A. 400 Crossing Blvd, 8th Floor Bridgewater, New Jersey 08807 jhlaskey@nmmlaw.com

Kevin L. Matthews NSI, LLC 1990 K St. NW Suite 320 Washington, DC 20005 kmatthews@nationalstrategies.com

# **Burns & McDonnell Engineering Company**

Lindsay Grise, Esq., Legal Counsel 9400 Ward Parkway Kansas City, MO 64112 Irgrise@bmnsmcd.com Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esq. fthomas@rpa.nj.gov

Kurt Lewandowski, Esq. klewando@rpa.nj.gov

Brian Weeks, Esq. bweeks@rpa.nj.gov

Shelly Massey, Paralegal smassey@rpa.nj.gov

Matko Ilic, DAG matko.ilic@law.njoag.gov

Alex Moreau, DAG alex.moreau@law.njoag.gov

Paul Yousif, Esq. VP, General Counsel & Corporate Treasurer 402 Blue Bird Blvd Fort Valley, Georgia 31030 paul.yousif@blue-bird.com

# Climate Change Mitigation Technologies, LLC

Slowinski Atkins, LLP Eisenhower Corporate Campus 290 West Mt. Pleasant Avenue, Suite 2310 Livingston, NJ 07039-2729 James Sherman jsherman@slowinskiatkins.com

Matthew S. Slowinski mss@slowinskiatkins.com

Sarah C. Stoner, Esq.

# **Direct Energy**

Christopher E. Torkelson, Esq. Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC P.O. Box 5404 Princeton, NJ 08543 ctorkelson@eckertseamans.com

Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC 213
Market Street, 8th Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17101
sstoner@eckertseamans.com

Karen O. Moury, Esq. Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC 213 Market Street, 8th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101 kmoury@eckertseamans.com

# <u>EVgo</u>

Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. Greenwood Avenue, Unit #301 Trenton, NJ 08609

Martin C. Rothfelder, Esq. mrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com

Bradford M Stern, Esq. bstern@rothfelderstern.com

Sara Rafalson Director of Market Development EVgo Services LLC 11835 West Olympic Boulevard, Suite 900 Los Angeles, CA 90064 sara.rafalson@evgo.com

#### **ENJ, EDF, NRDC- Eastern Environmental Law Center**

50 Park Place, Suite 1025 Newark, New Jersey 0710

William Bittinger, Esq. wbittinger@easternenvironmental.org

Daniel Greenhouse, Esq. dgreenhouse@easternenvironmental.org

#### Enel X

William Harla, Esq.
Decotiis, Fitzpatrick, Cole & Giblin,
LLP Glenpointe Centre West 500
Frank W. Burr Boulevard Teaneck,
New Jersey 07666
wharla@decotiislaw.com

#### <u>Tesla</u>

Kevin Auerbacher Senior Counsel Tesla, Inc. 1050 K St, NW, Ste 101 Washington, DC 20001 Kauerbacher@tesla.com

## <u>SunRun</u>

Kelley Drye & Warren LLP One Jefferson Road, 2nd Floor Parsippany, New Jersey 07054

Lauri A. Mazzuchetti Imazzuchetti@kelleydrye.com Glenn T. Graham ggraham@kelleydrye.com

# **MSEIA**

Matthew S. Slowinski Slowinski Atkins, LLP Eisenhower Corporate Campus 290 West Mt. Pleasant Avenue, Suite 2310 Livingston, NJ 07039-2729 mss@slowinskiatkins.com

#### **NJLEUC**

Steven S. Goldenberg, Esq. Giordano, Halleran & Ciesla, P.C 125 Half Mile Road, Suite 300 Red Bank, NJ 07701-6777 sgoldenberg@ghclaw.com

#### <u>Greenlots</u>

Thomas Ashley Vice President, Policy 767 S. Alameda Street, Suite 200 Los Angeles, CA 90021 tom@greenlots.com

Joshua J. Cohen Director, Policy 1910 Towne Centre Blvd., Ste. 250 Annapolis, MD 21401 jcohen@greenlots.com

#### ACE

Philip J. Passanante, Esq.
Assistant General
Counsel 92DC42
500 North Wakefield
Drive Newark, DE 19702
philip.passanante@pepcoholdings.com

Paul F. Forshay, Esq. Eversheds Sutherland (US), LLP 700 Sixth Street, N.W., Suite 700 Washington, D.C. 20001-3980 paulforshay@eversheds-sutherland.com

McCarter & English LLP Four Gateway Center 100 Mulberry Street Newark, NJ 07102-4056

Guillermo C. gaitiles@mccarter.com

Artiles Nathan C.Howe

# **ChargePoint**

Bevan, Mosca & Giuditta P.C. 222 Mount Airy Road, Suite 200 Basking Ridge, NJ 07920

Murray Bevan, Esq. mbevan@bmg.law

William K. Mosca, Jr,, Esq. wmosca@bmg.law

# **Power Edison**

Shihab Kuran, Ph.D. Power Edison, LLC 166 Deer Run Watchung, NJ 07069 salkuran@poweredison.com

# JCP&L

Lauren M. Lepkoski, Esq. FirstEnergy Service Company Legal Department 2800 Pottsville Pike Reading, PA 19612-6001 llepkoski@firstenergycorp.com

#### <u>Alliance</u>

Barbara Koonz Wilentz, Goldman & Spitzer, P.A. 90 Woodbridge Center Drive, Suite 900 Woodbridge, New Jersey 07095 bkoonz@wilentz.com

## **RECO**

Margaret Comes, Esq. Associate Counsel Rockland Electric Company 4 Irving Place Suite 1815-S New York, New York 10003 comesm@coned.com

Jack Carley, Esq. Assistant General Counsel Consolidated Edison Company of New York, Inc. 4 Irving Place Suite 1815-S New York, New York 10003 carleyj@coned.com Jennifer McCave, Esq. jmccave@bmg.law

Katherine M. Dailey, paralegal kdailey@bmg.law

Umar A. Sheikh, Esq. Offit Kurman 10 East 40th Street Suite 3500 New York, NY 10016 usheikh@offitkurman.com

Michael I. Krauthamer Alliance for Transportation Electrification michael@evTransportationAlliance.org

James C. Meyer Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland & Perretti LLP Headquarters Plaza One Speedwell Avenue Morristown, NJ 07962-1981 imeyer@riker.com

# **Sema Connect**

Josh Cohen
Director of Policy and Utility Programs
SemaConnect Inc.
4961 Tesla Drive
Bowie, Maryland 20715
josh.cohen@semaconnect.com

# **Electrify America, LLC**

Ira G. Megdal, Esq. Cozen O'Connor LibewrtyView Suite 300 457 Haddonfield Road Cherry Hill, NJ 08002 imegdal@cozen.com

William Lesser, Esq. Cozen O'Connor 45 Broadway, 16th Floor New York, NY 10006 wlesser@cozen.com David Apelbaum, Esq.
Senior Counsel
Electrify America, LLC
2003 Edmund Halley Drive
2nd Floor, Suite 200
Reston, VA 20191
david.appelbaum@electrifyamerica.com